

# JEWISH MEDICAL ETHICS

1989-2004



Volume I

Mordechai Halperin, M.D.  
David Fink, Ph.D.  
Shimon Glick, M.D.  
*Editors*

Leora Moshe  
*Associate Editor*

---

THE DR. FALK SCHLESINGER INSTITUTE FOR MEDICAL-HALACHIC RESEARCH  
JERUSALEM 5764/2004

Report of the Investigation Committee on Protection of  
 Hospitalized Mental Patients against Sexual Assault and Abuse 345-351  
*Justice (Ret.) Dr. Benzion Shereshevsky*  
*George Szekely, M.D.*  
*Ilay Averbuch, M.D.*  
*Rabbi Yair Israeli*  
*Rabbi Mordechai Halperin, M.D.*

Protection of Hospitalized Mental Patients against  
 Sexual Assault and Abuse 352-355  
*Justice (Ret.) Dr. Benzion Shereshevsky*

Protection of Hospitalized Mental Patients against  
 Sexual Assault and Abuse: a Critical Review 356-361  
*Yigal Ginat, M.D.*

Exaggeration on the Road to Progress 362-364  
*Ilya E. Averbuch, M.D.*

#### IV. ORGAN DONATION AND TRANSPLANTATION

Introduction to Organ Transplantation 367-370  
*Fred Rosner, M.D., F.A.C.P.*

Overview of Organ Transplantation 371-377  
*Arye Durst, M.D.*

Ethical Aspects of Organ Transplantation 378-383  
*Prof. Shimon Gluck, M.D.*

Organ Transplants: Responsa 384-391  
*Rabbi Shaul Yisraeli*

Heart Transplants in Israel 392-402  
*Chief Rabbinate of Israel*

The Adverse Effects of Live Kidney Donation 403-406  
*Alfred (Aharon) Drukker, M.D., Ph.D.*

Organ Transplants from Living Donors 407-426  
*Rabbi Mordechai Halperin, M.D.*

Organ Transplantation from Transgenic Pigs 427  
*TIM newsletter*  
*Rabbi Mordechai Halperin, M.D.*

Index of Topics 428-431  
*Rabbi David Fink, Ph.D.*

Index of Authors and Contributors to this Volume 432-438  
*Leora R. Moshe*

ation on humans in medical research nowadays. Your remarks appear to throw a serious doubt on my assumption.

I would therefore much appreciate your clarification on whether the knowledge gained on hypothermia from these experiments refers mainly to diagnosis or prognosis (e.g. how long a person can endure subnormal temperatures), or includes new methods to treat this condition by therapeutic discoveries or advances gained directly from the medical findings in the death camps. If the latter can be confirmed, I would obviously have to revise assumptions I have made and asserted for several decades past.

*Within a month I had the following reply:*

I am responding to your enquiry concerning whether "practical benefits of any kind" accrued from medical experiments by the Nazis.

Firstly, I would point out that I am one of about 40 scientists and medical experts that have referred to the Alexander Report over the last 20 years. I attach a list of journal citations of the Alexander Report which shows initial citations being in the early 1960's and our initial citation being in 1974. I would also like to draw your attention to the several citations of the Alexander Report in the book "Survival in Cold Water" (Blackwell Scientific, Oxford). The author is Dr. W.R. Keatinge (a physician at London Hospital). Chapter 6 of this famous publication cites Dachau results on cold water immersion several times. Also, Maclean, D. and Ernstei-Smith, D. cite the report in their book "Accidental Hypothermia," Blackwell, 1977.

I have brought the above references to your attention so that you may be aware of the large amount of "use" of Dachau data. If you take the time to analyse these publications, you may be able to decide whether or not such use has "practical benefits of any kind." I cannot give an opinion for the work of others. As for our citation of the Alexander Report, I can comment on its practicality. On our list of hypothermia publications (attached) I have put an asterisk besides two publications that cite the Alexander Report. Examination of these will show that in the Discussion sections I have referred to Dachau findings in two ways. One is to criticize the use (by others) of Dachau findings on survival in cold water for purposes of predicting survival time of average persons who are not lean and emaciated. It would be like using channel swimmers

lation of pluripotent embryonic stem cells (ES), which still have the capacity to differentiate into various specialized types of tissue elements. Introducing the genetically modified ES cells into blastocytes, one first obtains mosaic animals, from which are then selected those which have the desired gene in their gametes and can therefore transmit it to their off-spring. By crossbreeding, one can finally produce homozygous progeny.

This procedure could be simplified and shortened by transferring the nucleus of a genetically manipulated cell directly into an enucleated oocyte leading to the birth of a transgenic animal in a single step. Further, it would be unnecessary to work with embryonic stem cells, which are not the easiest to manipulate genetically. Instead the nucleus of various somatic cells, e.g., fibroblasts, could be used to lead to the birth of transgenic animals.

This is not the place to consider whether man has a right to engage in genetic manipulation of animals. Such manipulations have a very long history, having been practiced with various techniques in different historical periods. Inasmuch as the procedure does not involve additional cruelty vis-a-vis the animal, cloning should be justified under these rights.

### **III. The Possible Aims of Cloning in Humans**

None of the considerations favoring cloning in animals, as discussed above, is applicable to the cloning of humans. Transgenic acquisition of genetic characteristics affecting human gametes is universally considered to be prohibited (or subject to a moratorium) even for therapeutic purposes. Reproduction by cloning is a way of genetically manipulating gametes (i.e., by injecting genetic material from a donor into an oocyte). Nonetheless, it is proper to ask under what conditions this technology could be accepted for therapeutic purposes and to see whether applications do or do not transgress the prohibition against genetic manipulation of human gametes.

#### **I. Applications in Transplantation**

One of the most interesting scenarios proposed by J. A. Thomson of the Wisconsin Regional Primate Research Center is the application of cloning to produce transplantable tissues without actually producing any cloned humans. Such tissues would be syngeneic with respect to the donor and therefore completely